

Rabbi Jonah Geffen

Hallel Without A Bracha: How Do We Celebrate Israel?



1. סנהדרין צ"ד א:ט'

תנא משום רבי פפייס גנאי הוא לחזקיה וסייעתו שלא אמרו שירה...

1. Sanhedrin 94a:9

It was taught in the name of Rabbi Pappeyas: It is a disgrace for Hezekiah and his associates that they did not recite a song...

2. שבת קי"ח ב:ה'

א"ר יוסי יהא חלקי מגומרי הלל בכל יום איני והאמר מר הקורא הלל בכל יום הרי זה מחרף ומגדף כי קאמרין בפסוקי דזמרא

2. Shabbat 118b:5

Rabbi Yosei said: May my portion be among those who complete hallel every day. The Gemara is surprised at this: **Is that so? Didn't the Master say: One who reads *hallel* every day is tantamount to one who curses and blasphemes God.** He displays contempt for *hallel* by not reserving it for days on which miracles occurred. The Gemara answers: **When we say** this statement of Rabbi Yosei, we are referring to **the verses of praise [*pesukei dezimra*]**, recited during the morning service, not to *hallel* (Psalms 113–118) recited on special days.

3. פסחים קי"ז א:י"ח

ת"ר הלל זה מי אמרו ר"א אומר משה וישראל אמרוהו בשעה שעמדו על הים

3. Pesachim 117a:18

The Sages taught: This *hallel*, who initially recited it? Rabbi Eliezer says: Moses and the Jewish people recited it when they stood by the sea.

4. פסחים קי"ז א:כ'

וחכמים אומרים נביאים שביניהן תיקנו להם לישראל שיהיו אומרים אותו על כל פרק ופרק ועל כל צרה וצרה שלא תבא עליהם לישראל ולכשנגאלין אומרים אותו על גאולתן:

4. Pesachim 117a:20

And the Rabbis say that *hallel* was not established for any specific event, but **the Prophets among them instituted that the Jewish people should recite it on every appropriate occasion, and for every trouble, may it not come upon the Jewish people. When they are redeemed, they recite it over their redemption.**

5. רש"י על פסחים קי"ז א:ז'ב'

ועל כל צרה שלא תבא עליהם - לישנא מעליא הוא דנקט כלומר שאם חס ושלום תבוא צרה עליהן ויושעו ממנה, אומרים אותו על גאולתן כגון חנוכה.

5. Rashi on Pesachim 117a:7:2

This phrase is a euphemism. It is meant to say that if G-d forbid, the Jewish People are in danger and they are saved from it, we say Hallel on the redemption, for example, Chanukah. Rashi, ad loc., s.v.

6. תוספות על סוכה מד:

דאפי' צבור שאין שם כל ישראל יחיד קרי להו משום דאמרין בערבי פסחים נביאים אמרוהו ותיקנו להם לישראל שיהו אומרים אותו על כל פרק ופרק על כל צרה וצרה שלא תבא עליהן וכשנגאלין אומרין אותו על גאולתן ולכך נקט יחיד דכי ליכא כל ישראל אין גומרין אותו אלא באלו הימים אבל לגאולת כל ישראל אומרים אותו לעולם.

6. Tosafot on Sukkah 44b

For even a community that does not comprise all of Israel is considered an "individual" for it is stated in Arvei Pesachim (the tenth chapter of Pesachim), 'the prophets [uttered it and] enacted that the Israelites should recite at every epoch and at every trouble — may it not come to them! — and when they are redeemed, they recite it [in thankfulness] for their deliver.' For this reason, the term "individual" is used because if the entire Jewish People [is not included in the miracle] one does not complete Hallel, unless it is one of the days listed [in the Beraita]. However, if the entire Jewish People is redeemed, we certainly recite Hallel.

7. Meiri on Pesachim 117a

Any individual who experienced trouble and was redeemed from it is permitted to establish [recitation of] Hallel for himself on that day each year, but he does not recite a beracha on it. This is the law for each community. This is the principle of the prophets that one should recite Hallel on every trouble that they are redeemed from.

8. Yabia Omer Section 6 Orah Hayim #41 (R' Ovadiah Yosef)

...the reason we do not say Hallel on the last days of Passover is because then the Egyptians were drowning in the sea and it is written: "When your enemy falls, do not rejoice" (Proverbs 24:17)... according to this, in our case when through these wars many Jews and non-Jews were killed we should not recite song. How much the more so since the date of the 5th of Iyar where the state of Israel was announced as a sovereign and independent nation was when they were redeemed from troubles since the war continued afterwards more forcefully... In any case, we should not establish Hallel with a bracha for future generations since the joy is mixed with sorrow.